

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

Patrick Catena	-	President, District 4
John F. Palmiere	-	Vice President District 6
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-at-Large
Bethany Hallam	-	Council-at-Large
Jack Betkowski		District 1
Suzanne Filiaggi	-	District 2
Anita Prizio	-	District 3
Daniel Gryzbek	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Nicholas Futules	-	District 7
Michelle Naccarati-Chapkis	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
Robert Palmosina	-	District 12
David Bonaroti	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

April 24, 2024, 5:04 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

Jared Barker - Director, Legislative Services

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you for rising for the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance Recited)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Please remain standing for a moment of silent reflection or silent prayer.

(Moment of Silence)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you everyone. Please be seated. Jared, please take roll.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Bonaroti?

MR. BONAROTI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Grzybek?

MR. GRZYBEK: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Here.

MR. BARKER: All 15 members are present. And before we begin, I'd like to make an apology for being a few minutes late. I'm very sorry for that. Sorry to inconvenience everyone.

Councilman Macey, I believe you have a statement to make, or you want to make a statement.

MR. MACEY: Yes. Thank you. Mr. President, members of council and guests. On March 5th of this year, I made a statement at a council meeting, which was - it harmed some people. It pushed their buttons and hurt their feelings. And that's certainly what my statement was intended for. It was part of trying to make a statement that this world should come together.

Now, for any of those individuals that I harmed, I'm truly sorry. And for anybody else that may be harmed through this action, the action of it on March 5th, I'm very, very sorry. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We'll now have proclamations and certificates.

13019-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation declaring April 30, 2024, to be National Therapy Animal Day in Allegheny County, sponsored by Councilmember Catena and all other members of Council.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Good evening, Ms. Hanson. Hi. Welcome.

MS. HANSON: Hi. Thank you.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: It's nice to have you with us.

MS. HANSON: Thank you.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: I'm honored to read this proclamation on behalf of my colleagues. This is a proclamation declaring National Therapy Animal Day. Whereas there are thousands of pet partners therapy animal teams serving in communities across the United States, and pet partners has designated April 30 as National Therapy Animal Day. And whereas, pet partners therapy animal teams in Allegheny County play an essential role in improving human health and wellbeing through the human animal bond.

And whereas, scientific research shows that interacting with therapy animals can reduce stress, relieve depression, slow heart rate, lower blood pressure, and strengthen the immune system, and whereas, therapy animal teams interact with a variety of people in our community, including veterans, seniors, patients, students, and those approaching end of life. And whereas, these exceptional therapy animals who partner with their human companions, bring comfort, joy and healing to all those in need, and whereas, we encourage more pet owners to consider becoming pet partner volunteers to help our

community by creating happier, healthier communities through greater access to safe and meaningful interactions with therapy dogs and other therapy animals. Now, therefore, be it resolved that we, Allegheny County Council President Catena, and all members of Council do hereby declare April 30, 2024, to be National Therapy Animal Day in Allegheny County.

And we encourage our citizens to celebrate our therapy animals and their human handlers. In witness whereof I hereunto cause the seal of the County of Allegheny County to be affixed.

MS. HANSON: Thank you so much. I own and operate a small business that supports older adults, individuals with disability, and children with special needs. Also I'm a licensed counselor, and I'm an empty nester. This year, my daughter attends Penn State, and I was saying when she was done with school that I was going to get a therapy dog and start training it to take it out to see some of our older adult clients and our clients with severe mental health. So I've been working on that and I joined a few organizations and they brought this to my attention. So, I love Allegheny County.

I always say that our county does a really good job of supporting our older adults and people with severe mental health, more so than some of the other counties around us. So I appreciate the sensitivity and the making pet therapy day this month, at the end of the month as well. Thank you all.

(Photographs taken)

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13020-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation congratulating Mr. Jared Latchaw for being named the 2024 Big Brother of the year. Sponsored by Councilmembers DeMarco and Bonaroti.

MR. BONAROTI: Thank you, President Catena. Today we're here to recognize the tremendous effort that Mr. Latchaw has put in and invested his time over its last six years. Last six years serving with the Big Brother Big Sisters of Pennsylvania. Today we're recognizing that Mr. LaTchaw has been named the 2024 Big Brother of the year. And that's not just for Pittsburgh, that's for the state of Pennsylvania. So, congratulations.

So whereas Allegheny County is fortunate to have a number of teachers, community volunteers, and individuals who support the mentoring movement and who work selflessly to improve our children's odds for success

in overcoming adversity, and whereas, each year, Big Brothers Big Sisters of Pennsylvania selects a deserving Big Brother who exemplifies the best of one to one mentoring, and whereas Big Brothers Big Sisters of Pennsylvania has selected Mr. Jared Latchaw as the 2024 Big Brother of the year, and whereas six years ago, Jamari enrolled in the BBBS program as a fun, high energy and enthusiastic boy, he had no male role model, leading to diminished social skills, not performing up to his capabilities, or even seeing his potential.

His Big Brother, Mr. Latchaw, recognized the passion and potential in Jamari and made the commitment to do what was necessary to become a positive influence on his little brother so Jamari could reach great heights. And since being matched, Jamari has grown into a kind and respectful young man. His behavior is improving in school and his grades have markedly improved. Jamari says, if my mother didn't sign me up for BBBS, I would be doing a lot worse than I am now. I needed a male role model to put me on the right track and change my mindset. Mr. Latchaw took on this role and I will always be grateful for that. He has helped me in so many ways.

And whereas Mr. Latchaw fiercely advocates for Jamari and has approached their relationship with patience, enormous empathy, consistency and humor, Mr. Latchaw has a gift to give back and wanted to make a difference on his community by being a positive male role model to those that do not have any. Now therefore, it be it resolved that we, Allegheny County Council members David Bonaroti and Samuel DeMarco do hereby congratulate Mr. Jared Latchaw for being named the 2024 Pennsylvania Big Brother of the year. We commend him for his continued dedication towards serving as a positive role model, supporting vulnerable children and helping them succeed. In witness whereof I have hereunto caused the seal of the county of Allegheny to be fixed this 24th day of April, 2024.

MR. LATCHAW: Thank you, guys. It means a lot. And yeah, growing up, I didn't have any younger siblings. I always wanted a little brother to do things with. So that's one of the reasons why I signed up. And then, you know, I see, unfortunately, there's a lot of young boys growing up that don't have any positive male role models. And I just want to make a difference. I think that's what the world needs right now.

So you know, it's an honor to get recognized and hopefully I'm making a difference. Thank you.

Tell the folks what this program means to you and how much Jerry's been able to help this program. It means a lot to me. I was able to mature myself as a child to turn into a young man. Thank you, Mr. Jerry right here, helped me get through a lot of stuff in life, really.

MR. DEMARCO: Come up and say hello. You don't have to say anything other than tell the folks what this program means to you and how much Jared has been able to help.

JAMARI: This program it means a lot to me. I was able to mature myself as a child to turn into a young man. Thank you, Mr. Jared right here. He helped me get through a lot of stuff in life really. Just his presence in life helped me a lot, too. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13021-24.

MR. BARKER: That's a proclamation congratulating Ms. Lindsay Litterini for being named the 2024 Big Sister of the year, sponsored by Councilmembers DeMarco and Futules.

MR. DEMARCO: Folks you heard earlier, they were joking when we talked about honoring Big Brothers and Big Sisters today. We were talking about Tom Baker. Tom Baker was a former councilman for District One for at least eight years, okay. And was a community affairs officer with Big Brothers and Big Sisters. But more than that, he was the Big Brother to numerous little brothers over the years. And I can't tell you, knowing him, what a great difference he made in so many young men's lives. So that's why we really appreciate what you folks have done here in stepping up and volunteering many of your time to help our youth here in Allegheny County.

So whereas Allegheny County is fortunate to have a number of teachers, community volunteers and individuals who support the mentoring movement and who works selflessly to improve our children's odds for success in overcoming adversity, and whereas, each year, Big Brothers and Big Sisters in Pennsylvania selects a deserving Big Sister who exemplifies the best of one-to-one mentoring, and whereas, Big Brothers and Big Sisters of Pennsylvania has selected Ms. Lindsay Litterini as the 2024 Big Sister of the year. Did I pronounce that right, Lindsey?

MS. LITTERINI: You did.

MR. DEMARCO: Okay. Whereas entering their eighth year together, Ms. Litterini and her little sister Sarah first met during Sarah's sixth grade year when she was a shy, introverted, bullied middle schooler. Their match experience eventually grew into mutual trust, respect, friendship and a genuine love for each other.

Today, Sarah is a vibrant, outgoing, caring college student focused on her future plans, whereas Sarah is excited about her future and belief that she would not be where she is today without the influence of Ms. Litterini. Becoming a part of BBBS has inspired Sarah to attend college and experiencing the commitment and devotion of Ms. Litterini as her Big Sister makes her want to help others each day. And whereas being matched - being matched to Sarah has also impacted Ms. Litterini in many ways, namely making her feel as though she matters and is making a difference in Sarah's life. Sarah's continued interest in spending time with Ms. Litterini after seven years reinforces the idea of making a difference and appreciates the investment in her friendship.

Ms. Litterini knows it is the time spent together that makes the biggest impact on Sarah and her future goals. Now therefore be it resolved that we, Allegheny County Councilmembers David Bonaroti and Sam DeMarco do hereby congratulate Ms. Lindsay Litterini for being named the 2024 Pennsylvania Big Sister of the year. We commend her for her continued dedication towards serving as a positive role model, supporting vulnerable children and helping them succeed.

And also, Councilman Nick Futules is also part of this as well. In witness thereof I here unto for cause the seal of Allegheny County to be affixed this 24th day of April 2024. Thank you so much for everything that you folks do.

MS. LITTERINI: I just want to say thank you for this honor. It's been incredibly important that I'm recognizing Jared and Jamari for their success as well. Full circle moment as well, I worked for Big Brothers Big Sisters in 2016, which is how I first learned of the program and how I got involved and matched Jared and Jamari. And I think that's a really cool moment to stand here next to them. And Sarah and Jamari have kind of grown up in this program together. We've had a lot of fun

times at the different things that Big Brothers and Big Sisters offers, and we're incredibly grateful for that.

And I think it's just really neat to see the evolution of our friendships and that they're still interested in hanging out with us all these years later. And they have so many other things they could choose to do. So it's just an honor to be recognized here and standing here with our littles today. I think you get a chance to say something.

SARAH: I appreciate having Lindsay as my Big Sister for so many years. I wouldn't be going to college if it wasn't for her helping me through high school and middle school and still helping me to this day. I just want to thank you for everything you've done for me.

MS. LITTERINI: We have their parents in the room, and I think it would be remiss to not recognize them because they are an important role in this.

MR. DEMARCO: We're going to take pictures, right? So I'd like the parents to come up as well to be here today.

(Photographs taken.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13022-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation recognizing Women's Law Project on the occasion of their 50th anniversary, sponsored by Councilmembers Catena, Betkowski, Hallam, Grzybek and Prizio.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: May I be added to that?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Anyone else? Anyone not want to be added? Go ahead and add everybody, Jared.

MS. HALLAM: I am so excited to have Symone here to celebrate Women's Law Project, and I'm going to read this proclamation, and hopefully you'll say a few words out there.

A proclamation recognizing Women's Law Project's 50th anniversary. Whereas founded in 1974, Women's Law Project is a non-profit, public interest legal organization working to defend and advance the rights of women, girls and LGBTQ people in Pennsylvania and beyond. And whereas, Women's Law Project uses an intersectional analysis to prioritize work on behalf of people facing multiple forms of oppression based on race, gender, sex, ethnicity, class disability, incarceration, pregnancy and immigration status, and whereas having a focus centered on Pennsylvania sets Women's Law Projects apart from other

nonprofit legal organizations working on gender related issues.

Women's Law Project leverages impact litigation, policy advocacy, public education, and direct assistance and representation to dismantle discriminatory laws, policies and practices and eradicate institutional biases and unfair treatment based on sex or gender. And whereas Women's Law Projects believes reproductive freedom is the keystone to their work, and they seek equitable opportunity in many arenas, including healthcare, education, athletics, employment, public benefits, insurance and family law, and seek justice for survivors of gender-based violence.

Now, therefore, be it resolved that we Allegheny County council members, all of us do hereby recognize Women's Law Projects upon the occasion of their 50th anniversary and recognize their tireless efforts to leverage the power of the law to eliminate gender bias and discrimination. In witness whereof, I have hereunto cause the seal of the County of Allegheny to be affixed this 24th day of April 2024. Congratulations.

MS. HARMON: Thank you, Council. Thank you, Councilwoman Hallam and the entire Council of Allegheny County for recognizing the Women's Law Project's 50th anniversary and recognizing the half century of, as you stated, tireless efforts to eliminate gender bias and discrimination.

As most of us understand intimately, the work we do is not always linear. Sometimes the greatest battle is maintaining the persistence and urgency towards liberation. Fifty (50) years has given us the gift of time to build endurance and longevity, to defend and advance reproductive rights, to right the wrongs of our opponents, and to lay the groundwork for future accomplishments. If I am to speak of longevity and endurance, I should mention a case that spans decades, almost the entirety of WLP's lifespan.

In 1971, Pennsylvania became the first state to protect against sex-based discrimination under an Equal Rights amendment. Three years later, the Women's Law Project was founded. In a 1985 court case, Pennsylvania Supreme Court upheld a Medicaid ban on abortion, a decision that has prevented us from using the Equal Rights Amendment to challenge abortion restrictions as sex and gender based discrimination for nearly four decades. In

2019, WLP filed to overturn the Medicaid ban, and in 2024 we won. The court overturned the 1985 Decision and in turn reinvigorated our Equal Rights Amendment.

It has taken a truly formidable team of dedicated people to get us this far. So I'd like to thank our leadership, past and present, our current staff and former staff who remain our colleagues even beyond the walls of our organization. Thank you to the volunteer attorneys, undergrad interns, law students and legal fellows who have helped us along the way. And thank you to our clients who have trusted us with your stories.

You all have endured alongside us as colleagues, friends and supporters. It is you who have propelled us forward for five decades so that we may celebrate a 50th anniversary and hopefully many more. Thank you.

(Photographs taken.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13023-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation recognizing BOOM Concepts upon the occasion of their 10th anniversary, sponsored by Councilmember Hallam and all other members.

MS. HALLAM: So speaking of anniversaries, BOOM Concepts has a big one this year. We are here celebrating their 10th anniversary. You know, I'm a big fan of the work that you do, especially your tireless advocacy for keeping money for local artists and for supporting our local artists. That means so much to me and a lot of people I really care about. So I just wanted to personally thank you all for everything you do. But all council wants to celebrate you as well. So I will get into the proclamation.

This is a proclamation recognizing the 10th anniversary of BOOM Concepts. Whereas BOOM Concepts is a creative hub dedicated to the advancement of black, brown, queer and femme artists. BOOM Concepts is located in Pittsburgh's Garfield neighborhood and since its founding, has curated more than 50 exhibitions on site, paid out over \$216,000 in artist fees and produced over 200 events across the country. And whereas established in 2014 by D.S. Kinsel and J. Thomas Agnew with the support of Rick Schwartz of the Bloomfield Garfield Corporation in a collaboration effort with Rob Stefanie of the Heinz Endowment and Justin Lang of Hillombo. BOOM Concepts is dedicated to the development of underrepresented artists and creative entrepreneurs. And whereas their vision centers on creating spaces for black, brown, queer and

femme individuals, fostering open and rigorous dialogue that evolves into dynamic learning exchanges across communities, laying the foundation for more just actions.

And whereas, BOOM Concepts offers artist studios across Pennsylvania's neighborhoods, spaces and resources catered to each artist's creative and professional goals and host events such as film screenings, community meetings, music performances, dance parties and fundraisers. And whereas BOOM Concepts serve as a space for field building, knowledge sharing, mentorship and storytelling.

In its tenth year, BOOM Concepts continues to work with creatives to find innovation - innovative strategies around entrepreneurship and artistic practice. Now, therefore, be it resolved that all of council do hereby recognize BOOM Concepts upon the occasion of their 10th anniversary and recognize their dedication to the development of artists and creative entrepreneurs representing marginalized voices. In witness whereof I have hereunto caused the seal of the County of Allegheny to be affixed this 24th day of April 2024.

Congratulations.

MR. AGNEW: I want to say thank you to the council. Thank you to the city of Pittsburgh, the arts ecosystem, for supporting us for a very long time. You know, it's been great for us to do this work in Garfield. We have here with us Jules Mallis and Devon Rogers. My partner here, D.S. Kinsel. But, you know, it's been great to do this work to support artists. It's so important to make sure that they have sustainable income. A lot of small artist organizations are well underfunded, and we want to make sure that we support them in any way that we can.

We are ourselves a small artist organization. I mean, these people right here is who you see do all this work over the past ten years. But we also want to make sure that we support people that look like us. And you know, when were younger, we wanted to make sure that we had to support, and so we want to reflect that into the arts ecosystem now.

MR. KINSEL: Hey, I'm D.S. Kinsel, I just want to say thank you to Councilwoman Hallam and to the entire county council. This is really important. My family has been in this region for over a hundred years, so I thought it would be cool to bring my son down here.

You know, over the past ten years and much longer, Thomas and I have been supporting artists and creative entrepreneurs. And we really believe arts and culture are not only a way of translation, but a way to support the local economy here in this region. So just thank you.

We have a lot of good things happening this year, and please not let this be your only time knowing about BOOM Concepts.

(Photographs taken.)

PRESIDENT CATENA: The remaining proclamations will be read into the record.

13024-24.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President - Jared, could you please then add me and author to the last proclamation here on Autism Acceptance month, if Mr. Grzybek is okay with that.

MR. GRZYBEK: Yep, I think we're adding all that -.

MR. DEMARCO: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

MR. BARKER: 13024-24 is a proclamation declaring April 28, 2024 to be Workers Memorial Day in Allegheny County, sponsored by Councilmember Palmosina and all of the members of Council.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13025-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation proclaiming April 2024 is Arab American Heritage Month in Allegheny County, sponsored by Councilmember Gryzbek and all of this council.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 13026-24.

MR. BARKER: A proclamation proclaiming April 2024 is Autism Acceptance month in Allegheny County, sponsored by Councilmember Grzybek and all members of council.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We will now have public comment on agenda items.

MR. BARKER: We have a number. First up are Gene Khorey, Elyanna Sharbaji, Ali Asad, Khadija Djellouli, and Eyas Azzuni.

MR. AZZUNI: Council members -.

PRESIDENT CATENA: State your name for the record.

MR. AZZUNI: I'm sorry, before I do that, is it illegal to not mention my real address?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Just state your name for the record.

MR. AZZUNI: Okay. My name is Eyas Azzuni. The reason I don't want to state my address is because since the month ago and some ago, Mr. Macey made some Islamophobic comments, and since then I've been targeted for the himation campaign. Another person from the community had Child Protective Services called on him so - and they didn't find anything worthwhile. But it is a risk that Muslims are taking right now in the climate that Mr. Macey created.

And in addition to that, last week, the mosques in Allegheny County, in Monroeville in Pittsburgh, North Hill, they've been all receiving threatening letters. And I'm shocked that instead of fostering unity in our community, that we are even considering Mr. Macey for a position such as the Southern Pennsylvania Commission. I think everybody has prejudices, and I don't think Mr. Macey is inherently a bad person. I think that the prejudices that he has have come outside without being thought through. But that begs the question, are these prejudices going to come up when monetary incentives are distributed? Are we going to see something like Muslim neighborhoods not getting the same attention as non-Muslim neighborhoods? It's very hard as a Muslim to be attacked for just being a Muslim. And I don't think that incendiary language helps anybody in Allegheny County.

Please refuse the appointment of Mr. Macey. Thank you.

MR. ASAD: Hi, my name is Ali Asad. I'm from the South Hills Atlantic. Good evening. I'm here today to honor my grandmother. Believe it or not, it was a mean, tough, sweet lady, but I love her. Her name was Aziza. She was a strong Palestinian woman. A strong woman and a strong human being. Though she passed away, I am never without her. Along with my faith in God, I take my grandmother wherever I am. She came to this country in the 1960s for a better life with my grandfather and her ten children. She took English classes at night so she can help us navigate in this new world, so that we can take advantage of every opportunity. And she never backed away from the challenge and always, always stood against injustice.

She loved Palestine all the more for that reason. And she passed these traits along to her some 200

grand and great grandchildren who are now a great community leaders. And we have some of the most kindest and most respectful kids, all because of her. We are doctors, we are teachers, we are pharmacists, business owners, everything you can imagine. We are positive contributors to our America. There is no better person for me to talk about today. In light of this council's failure to pass a ceasefire motion for the people of Gaza in Israel. She would want us all to speak up in this room tonight. I see my grandmother's vision for us to be vocal advocates opposing any suffering and any inequity. And the people behind me today, my grandmother would be proud of you. I am proud of you, proud of the city, because you chose not to remain silent.

And what you show us is that when atrocities happen in this world, it's not because people were not against it. It's because some people, like some of you on this council, chose to let them happen, which tells us that you can't keep serving. And so we're either going to move you with our talk, are we going to remove you, we will run against you, and we will take your seats, and we will build a better America. And I know that we're not alone. We have some fearless leaders here, locally and abroad. We have people like Cory Bush and Summer Lee, who won a historic election last night because she is authentic in principle and cares about the values of every human life from Pittsburgh to Palestine.

And we know where the tide is going. It's on the side of human good. And so I leave you with this. You are either with us or you are against us. And we will not remain silent.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Irene? Not here. Brian - oh, Irene.

MS. TANDOC: Over 200 people signed the petition that we created to stop Bob Macey from being appointed. And today, some people here have and will give many reasons as to why Macey is unfit to be on the SPC. It could either because he's anti-trans, pro fracking, and the racism and suspicion towards immigrants. But ultimately, I think it boils down really to the fact that his views are not really progressive and not - extremely outdated. In the review Commission meeting in relation to this council meeting, Macey said his primary focus being on the SPC has been about transportation. This is a big problem because in this county, racism has always been a

part of the transportation system here. The country's health - this county's health department, literally quotes. They identify the interrelated issues of food deserts and transportation.

It's two of the most important areas for addressing the human rights to adequate nutrition for the region's residents. So you know, a lot of people might think that we're like snowflakes getting angry at him for saying those racist comments, but the people who are being affected by transportation issues which are causing these food deserts are marginalized communities like POC, immigrants and indigenous people. And honestly, I didn't even write this, but if you were to ask my parents as well why they came here was, it's not because of some hidden agenda. The agenda is clear to give me a better life. And I've been living here for over 15, 18 years. I went to college here. I like, you know, try to be involved with the community here.

And I think I've always evolved here also with the houses, population and communities where you can see clearly that they're not getting the transportation funds, they're getting gentrified and rich people and, you know, so, like, white people are getting, like, special treatment, you know, and having someone who has that power, because I'm just a normal citizen, of course I'm going to be angry about that. So yeah, that's why I think that him being on the SPC and continuing that would set us back, because the static and racist views will deter the progress of Allegheny County. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Brian.

MR. NUCKOLS: Hey, Council. This is Brian Nuckols. I live in Wilkinsburg. I'm here to oppose Bob Macey's appointment to the SPC board. My comment is mostly unprepared today. I agree with what I've been hearing from fellow commenters, but I really want to focus on the issue of vision, progressive policy vision. Transportation and infrastructure are huge issues. Pittsburgh is known now for sinkholes and crumbling bridges. This has happened during Councilperson Macey's tenure on the SPC.

We're lucky, though we're fortunate that we have a rich higher education and infrastructure, people in urban planning doing a lot of interesting research on progressive, climate friendly, green transportation and infrastructure. I'm calling on you all to start the

search again, to look for new blood, new vision for Allegheny County infrastructure and transportation. So that's my first point, is progressive vision for infrastructure and transportation.

And the SPC board, it's a really powerful institution where we can progress for the people of Allegheny County. I also want to bring up the topic of democracy. Over the last months, we've had unprecedented amounts of public comment, people getting involved. Frankly, the council's response to that has been extremely disappointing. We've been silenced. Public decorum is more important than democracy. Disrespected at every turn. Really, I speak for myself, I'd really like to open a new chapter of public participation.

This board could be a new opportunity for us to meet with your constituents to get suggestions. You should sit on this board. Got a lot of people who want to be engaged and hope that the door is open for you all. I'll end my comment there and save my time. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Cory.

MR. ROMA: Hello, Council. My name is Cory Roma. I'm a resident of Crafton Borough, and I rise today to speak in opposition to the appointment of Bob Macey to the SPC. I and many others present here were in attendance at the March 5th meeting where Mr. Macey expels unprompted and deeply racist, xenophobic, and offensive remarks against our immigrant community. Remarks for which I appreciate you apologizing, but you're only doing it because your nomination's on the ballot today. You've had a month and a half to say something, and just now you choose to say something.

I'm sorry, but it's too little, too late. You know, instead of censuring and condemning him, we're here discussing reappointing him to one of the region's most powerful agencies. How could you possibly fathom rewarding someone who spoke such hateful rhetoric? Think of the message that you'd be sending to our immigrant neighbors by making such a move. Or to the immigrants who are considering making this county a county which the center for Immigration Studies has designated a sanctuary county, their permanent home. By confirming this nomination, you will be effectively co-signing Mr. Macey's racist behavior and sending the message that hate towards immigrants - hate towards the immigrant community that

built this region and nation, doesn't get called out but promoted.

With me is my friend Brian, who will now hand the clerk copies of a petition signed by over 240 constituents and organizations like Costa San Jose and the Sunrise Movement in Pittsburgh, urging county to reject his nomination. In conclusion, I appeal to you all to vote down the nomination and reaffirm the message that we in Pittsburgh are stronger than hate, and relegate Bob Macey and his racism and xenophobia into the trashbin of history where it belongs. Thank you.

MR. RAGUNATHAN: Hi, everyone. My name is Nithin Ragunathan. I'm from District 13, downtown Pittsburgh. I'm here to oppose Bob Macey's reappointment to the SPC. As it's been brought up. He made some racist comments back on March 5, saying that immigrants come here, potentially with the rice papers and may have come here illegally, but may have a hidden agenda.

I just want to point out how odd it is that this many people are actually showing up to a county council meeting. I mean, before six weeks ago, I doubt many people ever showed up to these meetings. So the fact that at least a dozen people are here today just to oppose one man's nomination to the SBC is kind of incredible and shows you how opposed the county is to this kind of racism governing us through our institutions.

You know, I don't think this is a man that we can trust in one of these institutions. I know someone mentioned that this institution is really big on transportation. I don't trust him on our boards. I don't really trust him on our roads either given the DUI he had back in 2012. I don't really trust him.

You know, he doesn't really seem to have any regard for immigrants in this community, other drivers in this community, people of color in this community. So I don't really see why this man needs to be reappointed to the SPC. He's been problematic for a long time. He's been, frankly, a dinosaur on this board for a long time and a dinosaur in his community for a long time. And I think it's time we thoroughly rebuke this man and everything he stands for. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Tanisha.

MR. STIGLER: I am Josh Stigler from the North Hills. I'm speaking on behalf of Tanisha. Members of Council, I'm here today to strongly oppose the appointment

of unapologetic bigot Bob Macey to the SPC board. I'm not a conspiracy theorist, but I believe that some council members may be here with hidden agendas.

In the case of Bob Macey, that agenda is to codify their xenophobic and racist beliefs into county policies that affect the lives of our residents. A late apology right before a vote is not an apology. An apology has changed behavior, and your decision to wait until you had something to lose is proof that you have not changed your behavior. I'm sorry you were offended as not taking responsibility. The correct words are I'm sorry I said something deeply ignorant and offensive. Do better.

During the appointment hearing, four members of council voted against negatively recommending Bob Macey, voicing their support for their councilmen. Sam DeMarco, who spent his week targeting a black non-profit due to his inability to differentiate a C3 and a C4. Suzanne Filiaggi and John Palmieri. And lastly, Bob Macey, who voted to protect himself.

While these votes are shameful, they are unsurprising. I come to you today as a black woman who understands that comments like Bob Macey's are not just racist dog whistles, they are blaring calls to action. When a council member feels comfortable enough to express these beliefs in a public setting, they are comfortable enough to act on them. We have seen this before when it comes to votes on housing, minimum wage, and of course, the ceasefire resolution, this behavior is not out of character for Bob Macey. He's on record making transphobic comments claiming that protecting trans kids would lead to Kris Jenner being able to compete against women. Kris is already a woman, but sure, at a meeting about the unhoused, he asked if they were grateful enough to deserve shelter. Voting to appoint Bob Macey is voting to endorse his bigotry.

And I'm asking County Council to do the only correct thing and vote no on this negatively recommended councilmember. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Tom pike? Not here. Sam Schmidt? Not here. Kenneth Mostern? Not here. Mike Suley?

MR. SULEY: Hello, everyone. I haven't been here in a while. As you know, I've been a little busy with the appeals, but my name is Mike Sully. I live in the South Hills, Scott Township, and I think there's

another. There's an important vote tonight regarding a word that is not music to our ears. Reassessment. I was part of the oversight in 2001 and 2012, of the reassessments, and it's ugly. It's like a military operation. 600,000 properties. We have to go out and look at every property before we even decide what the values are. So I'm here. There are two issues.

One that hopefully you'll vote yes on tonight, is what you will do, hiring the chief assessor. At the present time, the county executive has to say so, and that's the way it's been for 24 years. And what I'm saying is, you know, we had an election last night, and you were elected to be active and not to be participants in this process. There's a lawsuit going on. There's a movement to have a reassessment, and I consider that aspirational at this point. But the judge will come down - what it really comes down to, and I've been in court 27 years on these reassessment issues. You have the judge, and it's almost like going into receivership when a judge takes over the assessment office, and the judge doesn't want to talk to you, doesn't want to talk to the county executive, the lawyers. The judge only wants to talk to the chief assessor. And your vote tonight, you're saying we want to be part of this process.

I have my notes. As you know, I don't read a lot from notes, but I have had the pleasure of working with, in one capacity or another, all seven chief assessors. George Donatello, Sue Case, Deb Bunn, Ed Schellenberger, Wes Graham, and Luke Fabian. And I'm just going to end it with, I hope the vote is yes tonight. Just make sure that the next chief assessor for Allegheny County has the professional credentials and has a few county wide reassessments in her belt. You never know what might happen next. Please vote yes on the chief assessor Bill. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Rachel Reed? Nathaniel Kelly? John Silvestri? Theron Gilliland?

MR. GILLILAND: Theron Gilliland, Jr. of Allegheny County Center on the North Side. Quote, I don't want to be a conspiracy theorist, but on the other hand, here we have a situation where people in this country may have come here legally, may have had all the right papers, but have come with a hidden agenda. This isn't a slip of the lip. This is a point of view. It came from the heart when it was spoken, and we all heard it. Half-assed

apology seven weeks later before an important vote, is not an apology at all, especially when the apology is for how people felt about it, not for the statement itself.

The Southwestern Pennsylvania Commission is supposed to direct the use of state, federal, transportation and economic development funds allocated to the region. And we cannot trust Bob Macey to do that without some sort of conspiracy theory in his head. Thank you. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Carolyn?

MS. SAVIKAS: Hi, I'm Carolyn Savikas. When I retired 12 years ago as a financial advisor from Morgan Stanley, there are a few things I wanted to do. I wanted to volunteer at Phipps Conservatory, which I do. I wanted to join the South Park Garden Club, again, which I did. I wanted to help plant the western Pennsylvania Conservancy. And most importantly, I wanted to try and bring back Stonemans. For those of you that are from the South Hills, Stonemans was a three pool thing that we could swim in as children. And I will tell you that as a child, I spent a lot of time there.

I began attending meetings with the Friends of South park in 2016. And I learned then that Allegheny County Foundation - Allegheny County Parks Foundation, was working on refurbishing these pools, and believe me, I was excited. I helped with meetings, I helped with fundraisers and anything else that needed done in the Friends of South Park.

As I became more involved, I began to notice that slowly people started leaving the organization. I didn't understand. Then in 2020, we were told that all activities of all friends groups were going to be suspended by Council as we - as you decided, are fate. Apparently there was a member of the North Hills Friends of South Park who believed that his membership gave him the ability to chop down trees. We didn't have anything. We didn't have anything like that in south.

When Council passed Bill Number 118-8021 the new ordinance governing the Council of Friends in each of the nine parks, we were all asked to appear before Council and answer a few questions. Bethany, you remember I - yeah, you were asking the questions. I sent each of you Mrs. Adams' response to that request. It seemed a very innocuous request to come and please talk about why you want to be on the Friends of South Park. In case you

don't remember the copies that I sent all of you. There's one quote that I think this is from Mrs. Sharon Adams, who is currently unavailable. It says I refuse to be interrogated by a committee who had no idea what we did all this year. So all the things that she listed Friends - were done by people on the committee and her and I'm out of time. Am I out of time?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

MS. SAVIKAS: Okay. She listed all the things that were accomplished by her and by many other people on the committee. But she didn't happen to mention that they were mentioned by the other people on the committee. Unfortunately, many members of the committee, as well as those belonging to the park staff and the park foundation have had difficulty working with Mrs. Adams. I understand that the parks director told his staff that they were not to listen to her but to their supervisors when he found out that she was directing people in the staff. This is not what Friends of South Park - you appointed us to do.

I feel very strange reporting these actions to you. But I feel that I understand that Ms. Adams has applied again to be on the committee - that's definitely -.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Yeah.

MS. SAVIKAAS: Has applied to the - and I'm just asking you to - currently to not accept her and put her back on the committee. We have two very wonderful new gentlemen. Like Jake Riley, a young man who's in his 30s, who lives in Bethel Park and comes to us from the Friends of the National Zoo. And Larry Cardillo, who brings lots of contacts with organized labor to get things done in the park. I ask you to consider their nominations. As opposed to Mrs. Adams. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We'll now have approval of minutes.

13018-24.

MR. BARKER: A motion to approve the minutes of the March 19, 2024 regular meeting of Council.

MS. HALLAM: So moved.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been moved in a second. Is there any discussion? Hearing no discussion. All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All opposed. Motion carries.

Presentation of appointments. All the presented appointments are referred to the Committee of Appointment Review. And I'd like the clerk to read - the clerk to read them all at this point in time. But before we begin, I want to verify that these appointments are actually all correct, because I know over the past few weeks the appointment - there's been some confusion over reappointments versus appointments and what have you. And I just want to - before I send any of these to committees. I want to make sure they're a hundred percent accurate.

So can we testify to the fact that they're a hundred percent accurate? Yes, they are. Okay.

Jared, please read them.

MR. BARKER: 13003-24 is approving the reappointment of Bernadette Fincke to the Friends of the Park for South Park for a term to run through July 6, 2027, sponsored by Councilmember Grzybek.

13004-24 is approving reappointment that Angela Sue Zemba to the Friends of the Park for South Park for a term to run through July 6, 2027, sponsored by Councilmember Grzybek.

13005-24 is approving the appointment of Corey Seymour to the Friends of the Park for Harwood Acres for a term to run through April 24, 2027, sponsored by Councilmember Klein.

13006-24 is approving the re-appointment of Richard Snipe to the Board of Property Assessment appeals and review for a term to run through June 30, 2027, sponsored by Councilmember Walton.

All of the remaining appointments are to the MWDBE Advisory Board, sponsored by the Chief Executive for terms running through December 31st, 2028.

13009-24 is for Barata Bay. 13009-24 is for Blayre I. Britton. 13010-24 is for Brian Burley. 13011-24 is for Cameil Williams. 13012-24 is for Guillermo Velazquez. 13013-24 is for Kanak Iyer. 13014-24 is for Melanie Marie Boyer. 13015-24 is for Roxanne Sewell. 13016-24 is for Tim Stevens. And finally, 13017-24 is for Victoria Snyder.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. We'll now have unfinished business. Committee on Appointment review for the second reading.

12957-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Sharon Adams to the Friends of the Parks, South Park for a term

to the effective through March 19, 2027, sponsored by Councilmember Palmieri.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes, President Catena. I just wanted to note that all of these on the agenda this evening went before the Committee on Appointment Review on April 17, 2024. This one was affirmatively recommended for Ms. Adams to the Friends of the Parks, South Park.

PRESIDENT CATENA: So is there a motion to approve?

MR. MACEY: I make a motion to approve.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second?

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded.

MS. HALLAM: Point of order, President Catena. I'd like to ask for a roll call vote on this one, please.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Roll call vote, please, Jared.

MR. BETKOWSKI: Excuse me. Is there going to be any discussion?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Oh, we can have - I'm sorry. Yeah, we can have discussion. Of course, Councilmember Betkowski. Go ahead.

MR. BETKOWSKI: Actually, I was hoping that my colleague might have some information.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead, Councilman Grzybek.

MR. GRZYBEK: Sure. So I mean, I think we heard the comments that Ms. Savikas shared with us. And obviously, I think those are a bit alarming. Especially someone choosing to direct county employees to take action certainly falls outside of the purview of the Friends of South Park. I also had several other members of the Friends of South Park who either were unable or just not comfortable coming in front of all Council today, reach out to me individually and share relatively similar stories.

Obviously, all of you received the email from Ms. Savikas for the reason of not applying for reappointment for Mrs. Adams. For those of you who attended the meeting on public review, you may recall that I asked about the reason for not reapplying because I knew that Mrs. Adams had served on that board previously and was the chair. You know, those of you who were there know

that the reason that were given is not the reason that was shared in that email. So for the kind of improper relations with county employees, very terse relationships with her fellow board members, as well as kind of a lack of forthcoming in her answers for appointment, I would not have voted in favor of her like I did during that. And I would be voting against her appointment here.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Any other comments this evening? Hearing none, Jared, please take the roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Betkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Bonaroti?
MR. BONAROTI:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Filiaggi.
MS. FILIAGGI:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES:	I'm going to vote yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?
MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Pالموسينا?
MR. PALMOSINA:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON:	No.
MR. BARKER:	President Catena?
PRESIDENT CATENA:	No.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 2, noes 13. Motion fails.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12958-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Daniel Connolly to the Allegheny County Airport Authority for a

term effective through December 31st, 2029, sponsored by the chief executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, as noted, the Committee on Appointment Review met on April 17, 2024, and affirmatively recommended Mr. Connelly. I'd like to make that motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, do we need a roll call on this, or is a voice vote fine? Looks like a voice vote is fine. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12959-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of Darren Kelly to the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for term effective through December 31st, 2029, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee met and affirmatively recommended Mr. Kelly to this position. I'd like to make that motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Is there a second?

MR. PALMOSINA: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion. Anyone object to a voice vote? Okay, a voice vote. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12960-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Paul Klein. To the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority for a term effective through December 31st, 2029. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee met and affirmatively recommended Councilmember Klein to this authority, and I'd like to make that motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Is there a second? Is there any discussion? Councilmember Betkowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Thank you, President Catena. Everyone here believes in representative government. It is one of the founding principles of our republic. And yet, on this board, the suburban ratepayers are left without a voice. That is wrong. Many of you have heard me tell this story. When I was working, I would meet with folks on their first day to tell them that the most important thing they could do for me was to have the courage to tell me when I was wrong. This is a mistake. And we know that because the county executive is promised in Allegheny County for all, the executive would never intentionally exclude any group from being represented. So I ask all of my colleagues to look within themselves for the grace to allow the executive a second chance.

A redo, if you will, an opportunity to correct what is so clearly a gross injustice.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Any other comment this evening? I'm hearing no other comments. Anyone object to --- well, actually, we're going to do a roll call vote on this one because I believe it's going to be an extension. So Jared, please take a roll call vote.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Betkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Bonaroti?
MR. BONAROTI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Filiaggi.
MS. FILIAGGI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN:	I'll be abstaining.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?
MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Pالموسينا?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Catena?
PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, noes 1 with one
abstension. Motion passed.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12961-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of
Diamonte Walker to the Redevelopment Authority of
Allegheny County, for a term effective through April 9,
2029, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-
Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the
committee met and affirmatively recommended Ms. Walker to
the Redevelopment Authority. I'd like to make that
motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Is there a
second?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made,
seconded. Any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote?
All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion
carries.

12962-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the re-appointment of
Dusty Elias Kirk to the Regional Asset District Board for
a term effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored
by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-
Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the
committee met and affirmatively recommended Mr. Kirk to

the Regional Asset District Board. I'd like to make that motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote? Hearing none, all those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12963-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Monica Malik, the Regional Asset District Board for term effective December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee met and affirmatively recommended Ms. Malik to the regional asset.

Speaker 1

Motion has been made in second. Is there any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed. Motion carries.

12964-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Jesse DiRenna to the Southwestern Pennsylvania Commission for a term effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee met and affirmatively recommended Mr. DiRenna to this position Southwest PA Commission. I'd like to make that motion.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Seconded. Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion - anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12965-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Robert Macey to the Southwestern Pennsylvania Commission for a term effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the committee met and negatively recommended Mr. Macey to this position on the Southwest PA Commission.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Is there a motion to approve?

MR. GRZYBEK: Motion.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Is there a second?

MS. HALLAM: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Discussion? Councilmember Futules.

MR. FUTULES: I'd like to start by saying that the beginning of this meeting, Mr. Macey had made an apology for what had happened in the past and some people accepted it, some didn't. We've all made mistakes in our life. I can't count the number of times I've made mistakes. And you have to learn to forgive people sometimes. Forgiveness is a part of life. I've learned to forgive people. I mean, I can't tell you how many times I forgave Dewitt Walton for what he said to me. Many times. I forgive you, DeWitt. Just want you to know that I forgive you. And I think it's an easy thing to say to people that you can forgive people. I forgive you, Bethany for the things you say to me, heck, yeah. Sure I do.

I forgive people because I've learned that you have to forgive people in life. And we all make mistakes. And I think we'll be in a tragedy if we don't have a representative on this council to keep us informed as to what's going on in this county. Not everybody may believe in that, but that's what I believe. And I believe everybody should have a second chance. I think a lot of people in the audience may believe that as well. We've all had second chances in life and made mistakes. If anybody in this room is perfect, you just let me know, because I know I'm not. Tanisha, she's perfect. Okay, Well, thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Next? Anyone else? Councilman DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, Mr. President. You know, when I had the opportunity to review the transcripts that was sent from the minutes that had been captured by the reporter here, I'm looking at this. And you had Mr. Macey made his comment, but right after he said hidden agenda, there was an outburst in the crowd. You, the president of Council, attempted to bring things under control. You asked for folks to be respectful, please be respectful. Mr. Macey tried to continue. And again, because of the outbursts in the crowd, you again implored the folks that were here - you asked them, you said you didn't want to make them - you didn't want to for - you didn't want people to be forced out of the room. If you carry on, I mean, you can't have it.

Who here has not been making extemporaneous comments at some point, you know, here. And then when interrupted, you lose your train of thought. Okay. Or fail to be able to carry on with what it was you were trying to say. So we don't know what Mr. Macey was going to say next because he didn't get the opportunity to do that.

We heard from a number of public speakers here today. And some of the messages that I heard repeated were they didn't believe he was progressive enough. They talked about his lack of progressive ideology. I heard a number of people talk about transportation, but they don't understand what the Southwest Planning Commission does because they don't have anything to do with the potholes out here or the roads, but they're planning major infrastructure projects throughout the 11-county region here in southwestern Pennsylvania. Okay.

I just think that we set a dangerous precedent when we sit here and vote against members of Council who have served honorably, you know, because of something they may have said. My colleague over here, and we worked together many times, you know, on the Board of Elections, but she at times has said that we should riot. She would burn police cars. She called the President Judge corrupt in front of her face. She called another Judge, a prick. I'm not saying this to pick on Bethany. I'm saying we've all said things, okay, but we on this body - anytime you speak, and to the extent that we do, we run the risk of saying something that offends somebody.

So I have had the opportunity to know Bob Macey into the ninth year. When I was first elected in 2015, before the general election even took place, Bob Macey asked me to go for a ride with him around his district. He wanted to show me his district and how it suffered. So we went on like a four and a half hour ride where we drove through McKeesport, Elizabeth Township, forward through his entire district, where he showed me why he fights so hard on behalf of Mon Valley because of the suffering that's taken place there since so many companies - the manufacturing facilities have left. So I know that the man has a good heart.

You know, I just voted for Councilman Klein for his position on the Sanitary Authority because I believe it's important that we stand up for the members of council, that we have representatives on this body. So folks, I will be voting for Councilman Macey. And I strongly urge that you folks do as well. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Grzybek?

MR. GRZYBEK: I want to start off by saying I do appreciate Councilman Macey's apology at the beginning of the meeting. I will echo though some of the comments that we heard from other speakers that I think the best time to apologize would have been immediately after making the comments. The second best time probably would have been the following meeting, third best time, the meeting after that. I'm a bit reticent to fully - I do - I mean, accepting the apology is - you know, I'm not the one that was offended by it, but I think fully appreciating its sincerity when it's coming at a time when Mr. Macey is eligible for appointment to a, you know, a board that he would like to be on.

To Councilman DeMarco's point, you know, I'm a very progressive person. I don't really care if Councilman Macey is progressive or not. I do care that he extends the same respect and dignity to all members of Council, whether they are immigrants or naturally born to the United States. I personally don't have to deal with people questioning, you know, what my motives are whenever I take actions.

And I can't imagine, you know, being someone who is a member of a county who has a very low immigrant population and having their intentions being even further taken into question. So you know, for that reason, I

don't think that we should be rewarding those actions with a board appointment. You know, if anything, I think if you go on either end of the spectrum, a censure vote would have been more appropriate than a board appointment. And you mentioned, Councilwoman Hallam's comments, I will, you know, point out that there was a censure vote attempted for those comments. We're not going down that path. We're not, you know, going to censure Mr. Macey, but I don't think a board appointment is appropriate. So I'll be voting no.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Hallam.

MS. HALLAM: Yeah, just a couple things. You know, I also appreciated the attempt at an apology at the beginning of the meeting, but again, a lot of the - it focused around how other people reacted to what you said, and I didn't see any accountability whatsoever for the fact that those were your words that you said and your beliefs that you espoused. You know, going off of what my colleague said about the disruption in the meeting shortly right after the comments. I think that President Catena actually potentially did a favor for Councilman Macey by stopping the conversation then before he dug himself into a deeper hole.

We are not attempting to remove Councilmember Macey from Council. We are not attempting to even censure councilmember Macey, which again, as my colleague so wisely pointed out, was attempted against me for not Islamophobic remarks, not transphobic remarks, not hateful remarks, but kind of like, you know, noticing things that were happening about my remarks. I also think that the best apology is change behavior. And as a public commenter pointed out, there were multiple instances that Councilmember Macey has espoused hateful viewpoints, including the Caitlyn Jenner comment that I personally witnessed, including multiple misogynistic remarks, homophobic remarks, transphobic remarks.

And again, there are 1.2 million people in this county. Why are we rewarding someone with such hateful views against people that not only he represents, but that we all represent, too? Why are we rewarding that? And so I will very obviously be a no on this. I will not ever vote for Councilman Macey for anything in my life.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Thank you very much, President Catena. I listened to a lot of the comments today, and at the meeting, the appointment review meeting, I'd like to address some of those things and give my take. One thing that was brought up by one of our councilmembers is that we needed a fresh face and suggested that because he himself was a senior citizen, that he is able to comment on the fact that perhaps we need a fresh face in that position and it's not Bob Macey, but I suggest that we do have a fresh face. And that fresh face is the county executive, Sarah Innamorato. She is the freshest of faces and she is the person who is actually putting Bob Macey up for this appointment.

And it's in her opinion and her fresh face and perspective, and I believe she does have some progressive leaning views as well, that she is appointing - re-appointing Mr. Macey to this spot. She understands how serious this is and how experience is important in this case. So I would say that is where our fresh face comes in.

The second point I would like to make is the concept that a tolerance, mercy and empathy. As a society, we ask, and we are asked to have a rehabilitative minded position today instead of a punitive position. And I'm hearing a lot of punitive talk and language and punitive-minded feelings and this doesn't match what some of the people in this group have asked us to do over the period of time. I am a - I highly respect Corey. You, I highly respect you. You and Mr. Macey have voted lock step in the Nippon Steel issue. You also asked us to consider your friends and colleague Manny for the position of the Jail Oversight Board. And we listened. I don't know if you know, but some of us were lobbied to not consider his nomination because he had a record, which he admits to. But you changed hearts and minds because you appealed to us with humanity.

And I'm asking people in the group to feel and act the same way. Mr. Macey has apologized. I think - so we need to accordingly give tolerance, mercy and empathy to a gentleman whose body of work has shown to be productive for county - the county. I also believe that threats against all public officials are increasing around the country.

And when no one reaches a finger to restrain the public pile on, which it does feel like, that's this in

this case, because we didn't vote the way you wanted. And Mr. Macey is an easy target. It leaves the impression that it can be open season on controversial officials and topics.

I am imploring all of my colleagues here to look at the body of work of Councilwoman Macey. He is a dedicated public official and judge him not by his words, on this occasion of heightened emotions, but look at how his actions have shaped council in a positive and productive way. I will most definitely be a yes vote in support of County Executive Sarah Innamorato of choice for the SPC board and yes for Bob Macey. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Anyone else? Councilmember Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Mr. President. I actually had a conversation with my colleague Mr. Macey about ten days ago. And I shared with him - I shared with him my thoughts and my concerns. And I would say that I appreciate your words tonight, but I would say that we're talking about a meeting that occurred 50 days ago. And it does appear in this moment, as we're facing a vote on this particular appointment, that it does appear to be an apology that in some way transactional nature. And I'm concerned about that as well. I remember that night quite well, as many of you who were in this room do. And it was a night in which great emotion was on display.

And so in that evening, those words, what was expressed that evening, were probably felt much more deeply than they might have been on another evening in a different context. But I am concerned enough about what was said that evening. And I also think about it in the context of what I do in my paying job. And that is, I spend a good deal of my time teaching a course in managing diversity in organizations. And I think that certainly plays a part in my thinking, in how I try to understand and engage with the world. So I did share my thoughts with Mr. Macey, and I will not be supporting this nomination, this re-nomination.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Anyone else this evening? Go ahead.

MS. HALLAM: Just that I think it is also incredibly racist to use the example of a black man with a criminal record being appointed to the Jail Oversight Board for work that he has earned, work that he pours his life into, equating that with someone who makes racist

statements is inherently, in itself racist as well. And I would hope that you just didn't take the time to think through that statement before you made it. So I'm going to give you just some time to think about that. I just thought that was absurd and unnecessary.

PRESIDENT CATENA: All right.

We're moving on to the vote. Roll call vote, please, Jared.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Bedkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Bonaroti?
MR. BONAROTI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Filiaggi.
MS. FILIAGGI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN:	No.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY:	Yes.

MS. HALLAM: I'm sorry, point of order, President Catena? Can we get an opinion on voting for yourself? I know that Councilmember Klein abstained when he was up for an appointment.

ATTORNEY FRANK: I rendered my opinion on this. The Commonwealth court said the person can vote for themselves. It is however, as I've indicated, that under the County Ethics Code, members should abstain from voting, but then voting for themselves does not void the vote. The resolution of that would be under the Ethics Code, where there are various provisions for violation.

MS. HALLAM: Okay. So to clarify, it's not illegal to vote for yourself, it is just potentially unethical.

ATTORNEY FRANK: It's a potential violation of the County Ethics.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Potentially an ethics violation.

MS. HALLAM: Thank you.

MR. MACEY: I'll abstain.

PRESIDENT CATENA: You're changing your vote to an abstention.

MR. MACEY: Yeah. I want to get along.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey abstains then?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Abstain. Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: NO.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?

MR. PALMOSINA: No.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Nick, don't get me started. I've been nice for a couple of weeks.

MR. FUTULES: I forgive you.

MR. WALTON: No, I don't give a damn whether you forgive me. Don't get me started. I abstain.

MR. BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Just please give your reason for abstention to the clerk within a week, please. I vote no

MR. BARKER: Ayes, five. Noes, eight, with two abstentions. The motion fails.

PRESIDENT CATENA: 12967-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Jamilah Ducar to the Regional Asset District Board, for term, effective through December 31, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Cantina, the Committee on Appointment Review met on April 17, 2024, affirmatively recommended Ms. Ducar to this appointment. I'd like to make that motion?

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Discussion? Hearing no discussion, does anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed. Motion carries.

12983-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Dora Walmsley, Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County, for a term effective through April 24, 2029, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena the Committee on Appointment Review met and affirmatively recommended Ms. Walmsley to the Redevelopment Authority, and I'd like to make that motion.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All opposed. Motion carried.
12984-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Diamonte Walker to the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher Education Building Authority, and the Allegheny County Residential Finance Authority for a term effective through April 9, 2029, and approving the appointment of Diamonte Walker to the authority for improvements of municipalities for a term, effective through April 9, 2029 sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccaratti-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the Committee on Appointment Review met and affirmatively recommended Ms. Walker to these authorities, and I'd like to make that motion.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Does anyone object to a voice code? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12985-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Kyle Chintalapalli to the Allegheny County Industrial Development Authority, the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority, the Allegheny County Higher

Education Building Authority, and the Allegheny County Residential Finance Authority for term effective through December 31st, 2028, and approving the appointment of Kyle Chintalapalli to the Authority for Improvements in Municipalities for a term, effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the Committee on Appointment Review met, affirmatively recommended Mr. Chintalapalli to the authorities. I would like to make that motion.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12986-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Michael A. Gable, the Professional Services Review Committee for term effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

MR. PALMIERE: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the Committee on Appointment Review met and affirmatively recommended Mr. Gable to this committee. I'd like to make that motion.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Is there any discussion? Does anyone object to a voice vote? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: All those opposed? Motion carries.

12987-24.

MR. BARKER: Approving a reappointment of Jennifer M. Liptak to the Retirement Board of Allegheny County for a term effective through December 31st, 2028, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Naccarati-Chapkis.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: President Catena, the Committee on Appointment Review met and affirmatively

recommended Ms. Liptak to the Retirement Board and I'd like to make that motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Anyone object to a voice vote?

MS. HALLAM: I do, President Catena. I'd like a roll call.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Okay. Roll call vote, then, Jared.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Betkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Bonaroti?

MR. BONAROTI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Grzybek?

MR. GRZYBEK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Hallam?

MS. HALLAM: No.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Pالموسينا?

MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?

MS. PRIZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President Catena?

PRESIDENT CATENA: No.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 13, noes 2. The Bill passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Committee on Assessment Practices for the second reading.

12915-24.

MR. BARKER: An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, amending Article 209 of the Administrative Code of Allegheny County entitled Office of Property Assessments Dection 5-209-05, entitled Chief Assessment Officer duties and responsibilities in order to establish a mechanism for ensuring continuity in the Chief Assessment Officer position, sponsored by Councilmember Catena.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Councilmember Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Thank you very much, President Catena and members of Council. The Assessment Practices Committee met on April 18, 2024 to reintroduce Bill 129.1524. After quality discussion, the committee voted to move the Bill to hold council with a new recommendation. The record will reflect that this Bill was previously referred to committee in February and affirmatively recommended to full council. For logistical reasons not substantive, the Bill was held and re-referred to committee. The Bill that appears before us today is the same Bill that was affirmatively recommended in February. We chose a mutual recommendation on April 18th to allow time in case someone wanted to introduce an amendment. No amendments have been introduced and it is the opinion of this chair that none are necessary. Therefore, I make a motion to approve.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been and seconded. Is there any discussion? Hearing no discussion. Roll call vote, please, Jared.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Betkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Bonaroti?
MR. BONAROTI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Filiaggi.
MS. FILIAGGI:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK:	Yes.
MR. BARKER:	Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM:	Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?
MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: No.
MR. BARKER: President Catena?
PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes, 14. Noes 1. The Bill

passes.

Thank you everyone for passing this Bill. I believe it's a good start forward. So thank you, Councilmember Filiaggi for passing this through.

MS. FILIAGGI: Thank you, members of Council.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Committee on Budget and Finance for the second reading.

1299-24.

MR. BARKER: A resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the grants and special accounts budget for 2024. Submission number 02-24, sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember Palmosina

MR. PALMOSINA: Thank you, President Catena. The Budget and Finance Committee met on April 18 and recommended this resolution. I move to approval.

MR. GRZYBEK: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion has been made and seconded. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, roll call vote, please, Jared.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Betkowski.

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Bonaroti?

MR. BONAROTI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?
MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Catena?
PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 15, noes 0. The Bill passes.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Liaison reports, any liaison reports this evening? Councilmember DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you very much, Mr.

President. Yesterday in Allegheny County we had a primary election. The election staff did a phenomenal job except for a minor glitch in McKees Rocks at the beginning of the day. Most of the rest of the day was pretty much uneventful. The mail in and absentee ballots that had been submitted prior to yesterday had all been opened, extracted and were in the process of being scanned. By 1:30 p.m. Those workers were sent home. The turnout was exceptionally low. It only reached 32 percent on the Democrat side and just under 27 percent on the Republican side. We'd like to see more engagement from the folks that are out there.

You know, mail-in and absentee ballots are an excellent opportunity for you to take it, weigh in and have your voice heard, even if you choose not to go to the polls. But you know, all in all, I want to give kudos to the election staff, the division, they did a phenomenal job and you can't thank them enough for the hard work they

do. And all the 6,874 workers that were brought on board and worked with polls on a very long day. And what turned out to be boring, I guess in many cases because of the low turnout in our communities. So thank you all. Thank you, Mr. President. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Any other Council people.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah, I'd like to add to that. Sam and Bethany. There was, I would call it another glitch that maybe nobody's recognized yet, but there was a deadline for asking for a mail-in ballot. My wife and my children actually applied early and got a response and they found out that the last day that they could respond, I believe the 16th or 17 April, the ballots didn't come to our house until Saturday, two days before the election. So what had happened, we, my wife and my kids had to individually go to Boyce Campus to drop the ballots off because you couldn't take all three, you know, individual. But I think it would be in favor of this county to move the deadline up further so that people can get their ballots on time. I hope that's been addressed.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Go ahead.

MR. DEMARCO: Councilman Futules, that is state law. That is not county law. State law says that you have up until 14 days prior to an election to be able to register and up to seven days prior to election to be able to request a mail or absentee ballot. And I'm glad that your family took advantage of the ballot return sites that we had here in Allegheny County and they were able to take and return them there. But you know, that, unfortunately, that does seem to happen. I know. I'm sure my colleague probably did the same thing as I do. We get a lot of emails here as the election approaches from folks that are, hey, I didn't get my ballot or I'm desperate. That's why planning ahead is the best thing in my opinion.

You know, apply now for your mail-in and bail for November when it comes, or if it doesn't come soon after the county announces that those first ballots have been mailed, start looking into it then instead of waiting till the end in which you're in a tight situation and you want to vote but the ballots haven't been sent yet, try getting ahead of it.

MR. FUTULES: Some people actually didn't realize they didn't get through or didn't get it. A lot.

MR. DEMARCO: But we try to avoid those, but yes - but overall they did a great job.

MR. WALTON: I'd like to make a comment if I could. In this election - and this is a conversation that I'm going to have with the county executive. But I also want to share with the two members of council that are members of the Elections Board. I believe that drop off sites for ballots are important.

I think it expands the opportunity for folks to ensure that their votes are counted. In 2020 the previous county executive did drop off sites for the general election, and they were in a wide range of communities across Allegheny County. And we talk about intentionality, purpose and design. And I'm not going to make an accusation one way or another, but there were a number of drop off sites and none, not one, was located in an African American community.

Now, we talk about intentionality, we talk about our behavior, that could be construed as being racist. I'm not going to make an accusation and say it was. I'm going to say that it was a mere oversight, but there's an opportunity to fix it. And I'm going to have a conversation with the county executive and ask that she amend and make sure that that is done.

And maybe we can do it as opposed to one day. Maybe we can do it on multiple occasions. So there are a host of opportunities to ensure that certain things occur. So to you, Nick, I say this, and I can say that because of your behavior, you know, and your engagement and your lack of - could be construed as racist, you know, but again, I'm not going to say that. I'm going to say that we can fix things. Let's fix them.

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember DeMarco.

MR. DEMARCO: I know that my colleague and I would be happy to sit down and talk to Mr. Walton, you know, as we look towards the ball here.

MR. WALTON: Well, I want to talk to my colleague because she calls folks pricks. She - you know, she calls folks pricks. You know, she's very intentional in her behavior. So, you know, I don't have anything in common with.

Well, Councilman Walton, I'll be happy to talk to you, but I would say something. You mentioned that you would reach out to the county executive, and I think it's

important - all these decisions that we're talking about need to be made by the entire Board of Elections. These aren't arbitrary decisions that are made by one person. So - but we'll look at this. And just one thing to note, this wasn't for one day. You had six locations that were operating in Allegheny County over two weekends. So total four days. So that's the access that people had. On the other side. If you look at it from a return on investment standpoint, those six sites over both weekends total four days. There was less than 2,800 mail in ballots returned.

MR. WALTON: And that's interesting, because in 2020, on those three single days - or wait, was it - the county manager may be able to correct me, but four years ago, was it three days? It was Friday - it was Saturday and Sunday. It was Saturday and Sunday, two days.

MR. DEMARCO: These were Saturday and Sundays as well.

MR. WALTON: If I remember right, the numbers total somewhere around 28,000.

MR. DEMARCO: The difference was in 2020, were in the midst of a pandemic, you know, and folks didn't - were afraid along lines in the polls on Election Day, mail-in ballots have been requested by many other folks. I guess what I'm pointing out here is just what our election folks did. Our elections division performed admirably with what we asked them to do. Things, you know, were very well there.

People can make a judgment on whether the 2,800 ballots collected, you know, were worth the cost. You had county employees as well as police officers, each of these locations. You know, we can talk about it for the fall, but I just want to give the people a report today based upon what took place yesterday.

MR. WALTON: I don't think that, and I'm not speaking to anything negative about the activity. I think it's - I think it was - it's important to do, to expand in every way possible people's ability to cast ballots.

My one concern, as I mentioned before, not one drop off site was centered in an African American community, and that's my only concern.

MR. DEMARCO: Well, the county office building was open in addition to all these other sites. But, you know, I'm certain we'll take that under advisement. Thank you very much, Councilman Walton.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Councilmember DeMarco, quick question. Would you be able to find out - I'm just curious how much this cost us and if we could find out how much any of this cost.

MR. DEMARCO: I'm certain we will be asking here before our next BOE meeting.

PRESIDENT CATENA: I'm just curious. I'm always about the money. So thank you, Councilmember DeMarco.

Any other liaison reports? No other liaison reports we'll move on to New Business Ordinances and Resolutions.

13027-24.

MR. BARKER: An ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth Pennsylvania, amending the Administrative Code of Allegheny County, Article 210, entitled Assessment Standards and Practices in order to provide for periodic county wide reassessments as required by Commonwealth law, sponsored by Councilmember Hallam.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. That's going to go to the Committee on Assessment Practices. Bew Business, motions.

13028-24.

MR. BARKER: A motion the Council of Allegheny County authorizing a public hearing pursuant to Section 801.05 of the Administrative Code on Wednesday, May 22nd, 2024, at 5:00 p.m. in the Gold Room of the Allegheny County Courthouse, sponsored by Councilmember Catena.

PRESIDENT CATENA: The focus of this public hearing would obviously to - we're obviously facing in court - or I should say we have administration is facing a possible reassessment that's being challenged or that's being proposed by the City of Pittsburgh Public Schools. My goal by having this public hearing is to gather information and be proactive to try to position this council to be informed about what the impending tsunami may be coming, possibly down the pipe, for a court ordered reassessment.

I have serious concerns about making sure that we're as prepared as possible, because in prior years, the reassessment didn't go as smooth as it probably could have. And if it's coming before us, I want to make sure we're as prepared as possible. I'd like to invite experts in. I ask all of my fellow colleagues and council members to think of who you would like invited in this hearing so we can bring them in to receive expert testimony from

these people on this possible pending reassessment, so we can answer, get answers to any questions that we may have about anything going on, about any concerns that we have.

Basically, we need to do is Council needs to perform their due diligence in what is possibly approaching us, and I'm not sure what the future holds, but I want us to be prepared as much as possible by doing this. So that's why I'm offering this motion tonight. If anyone has any questions, I'd be happy to answer to them.

MS. HALLAM: A comment. I want to say after we pass this and set this, anybody who is watching, anyone who is in the audience, if you want to come learn about reassessments, if you want to give comment about reassessments, please, I implore you to do that. We really do want to hear from you, and we want everybody to learn from the same information that we're learning from so that we're all on the same page about it. So I'm a hard yes on this.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Can you make it a second?

MS. HALLAM: Oh, yes, second. But yeah, I'm hard yes on this, and I hope that everyone else will come. And it's a really sexy topic. So please come on down on May 22nd and learn about reassessments. Thanks.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Any other comment? Hearing none, Jared -.

MR. FUTULES: I'm sorry. We might have to have so many people commit to having a public hearing.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Three people already committed.

MR. FUTULES: I didn't know.

PRESIDENT CATENA: It's an actual motion. This is the abbreviated motion.

MR. FUTULES: All right.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Roll call.

MR. BARKER: On the motion to approve, Mr. Bekowski?

MR. BETKOWSKI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Bonaroti?

MR. BONAROTI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Filiaggi.

MS. FILIAGGI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Grzybek?
MR. GRZYBEK: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Hallam?
MS. HALLAM: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
MR. KLEIN: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Naccarati-Chapkis?
MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmosina?
MR. PALMOSINA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Prizio?
MS. PRIZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President Catena?
PRESIDENT CATENA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes 15, noes zero. Motion passes.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Thank you. Notification of
contracts?
MR. BARKER: We have none.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Public comment on general
items.
MR. BARKER: We do have a few. The first is
Regis Ryan.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Not here.
MR. BARKER: Next would be Alex Pagareski.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Not here.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Anthony Moreno.
PRESIDENT CATENA: Not here.
MR. BARKER: Mohamad Hamad.
PRESIDENT CATENA: He's here.
MR. HAMAD: Hello, everyone. My name is
Mohammad Hamad. I am a United States service member. I
am in the United States Air Force. And would like to
start off by saying all the comments that I have are my
opinion and not of the Air Force. We're told to say that
when we talk in public. But I just wanted to bring up the
topic about my friend. Unfortunately, he can't really be
here, and I'll explain why. But I'd like to give light on
what kind of stuff is happening in Palestine. And my
brothers and sisters were suffering over there, my Muslim

brothers and sisters, and of course, my Christian friends over there in Gaza.

So I have a friend who is Palestinian American. He was born here in America, and he travels to Palestine all the time. And I always tell him, like, it's a little dangerous, like, he tells me, like that's where his home is, you know, like, that's where his family lives. And I understand where he's coming from, because all my family is in Lebanon. Only my immediate family is here, and they get very lonely. So I know a lot of people here have a family here, their whole family here. So please don't take it for granted. Family, it's very important.

But I wanted to say that he plays soccer professionally for a college. I'm not going to name it because I don't want it to be all over, you know, people coming after him and stuff. But he plays professional soccer for college. And one time when he went to Palestine, I told him, like, I kind of had a hunch you shouldn't go. And this was all before October 7. I had a hunch he shouldn't go. He went anyways. And this is kind of when things were starting to heat up. He was shot in the leg by an Israeli military officer. He was shot with an M4A1. It's an American rifle with a 556 NATO round.

This is - these are rounds and dollars that are coming out of our taxpayer money to be causing this. He came from soccer practice. He was heading home. Israeli intelligence found out that he played soccer and shot him specifically in the leg so that he could not play here anymore. And I - this is kind of. This is kind of why we asked for a second ceasefire. He's from the West bank, which is, as you know, it's a separate land mass from Gaza. And so calling ceasefire really only helped Gaza, the people who are still under military apartheid law.

You know, as we know, West bank is under a military occupation where these people don't really have rights. You know, thankfully, I'm not going to lie, I'm a big 2A second amendment supporter. I feel very safe here in America knowing that if any burglar was to come in my home or to shoot me or trying to kill me in my sleep or whatever, I can protect myself and defend my family. Over there they don't have those rights because they're under military occupation.

For example, there's a loophole in the law that allows you to take some Palestinians home. And there's a very viral video of a woman - of a man from New York, his

name is Jacob, who stole a Palestinian family's home, who's been living there for thousands and thousands of years. And when the family told him, don't steal my land. This is my house, Jacob, he said, if I don't steal it, somebody else will. So this is what I'm saying. I'm asking for. If anything comes across your desk, please vote for ceasefire. Please. We cannot keep defending and giving our money to these people who are attacking our own.

PRESIDENT CATENA: If you can wrap it up. Thank you.

MR. HAMAD: I appreciate it. Thank you.

PRESIDENT CATENA: Motion to adjourn.

MR. DEMARCO: So moved.

MS. HALLAM: Second.

PRESIDENT CATENA: All of his favorite, signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes)

PRESIDENT CATENA: Those opposed? The motion carries. Thank you everyone.

MEETING CONCLUDED AT 6:53 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Dated the 8th day of May, 2024

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Chelsea Curry", written over a horizontal line.

Chelsea Curry,

Court Reporter